

Redevelopment Ready

Marketing Communications Plan City of Saginaw

August 3, 2018

HEN THE TERM 'RUST BELT' BECAME POPULAR in the 1980s, Saginaw was well on its way to becoming a poster child for what it meant: A city that had grown in population, in wealth and in quality of life as a key player in America's industrial revolution — but had experienced tremendous decline and disinvestment in the last quarter of the 20th century.

Michigan was one of the states hardest hit by that decline. But it has fought back, with a variety of tools to help its cities recover. Redevelopment Ready Communities[®] certification is one of those tools. It's designed to help communities attract and retain new business investment and new residents by instituting best practices in economic development and placemaking. One of those best practices is to have a marketing communications plan in place.

This is that plan, representing approximately six months of research, planning and creative thought to position Saginaw for its next wave of growth and prosperity.

As we shall see, the fact that Saginaw has, indeed, experienced "waves" of economic growth over the years is an important proof point for one of the more difficult tasks you face: convincing people that great things not only can happen here, but are happening already. As we discovered in our research, some people need some convincing.

A large percentage of Saginaw-area people — and your key stakeholders — believe that many things in Saginaw are better than they were five to 10 years ago; there's a keen sense of optimism.

But that optimism isn't as deep, nor as widespread, as we would like it to be. As we have discussed, Saginaw's economic development "insiders" are extremely optimistic and excited at the considerable progress that has been made in the last decade. Crime has been significantly reduced, thousands of blighted structures have been removed, and development, especially in the area bordering the riverfront, is occurring at a pace we haven't seen in more than 50 years.

But how much of this positive action do the "non-insiders" recognize? And what are the major differences between those who "get it" and those who don't? These were questions we felt were important; a description of our research efforts follows.

Research

Stakeholder interviews were a given: they were specified in your RFP. But we knew they would not provide reliable answers to many of our questions. To get a clearer sense of perceptions outside the "insiders," we developed an online survey to complement those interviews. We also completed a brief, but insightful, interview session with the Neighborhood Association Action Group (NAAG).

One question was asked in each of the primary research tools: "What makes Saginaw unique?" There were two reasons for this. First, it helps us as we attempt to develop messaging that differentiates Saginaw from other localities. Second, and more importantly, it reveals even more about the person answering the question.

Interviews

Developer/Stakeholders

We were less successful in landing interviews as we had hoped to be; many of our initial emails went unreturned. Subsequent conversations with many of these intended subjects, however, simply confirmed things the interviewees said – and, to be honest, what we had expected.

We completed 10- to 20-minute interviews with three business owners who have invested in development projects in the City of Saginaw. They were free-ranging conversations that centered around four main questions:

- Compared to five to 10 years ago, is Saginaw's economy, quality of life and development climate better, worse or about the same?
- What makes that true?
- Is working with the City of Saginaw on development projects now easier or harder than it once was?
- What do you believe makes Saginaw unique?

All agreed that life and business in Saginaw is "definitely," "dramatically," "100 percent" better than in the past decade. All pointed to the synergy of different types of development occurring, particularly Downtown and along Washington Avenue — bringing together an entertainment district, dining and nightlife, market-rate housing and development by Delta College and the Central Michigan University School of Medicine. "Everybody's rowing in the same

direction," said one, to bring about the kind of development that "was just a wish to a generation ago."

One acknowledged the important role played by Saginaw Future, Inc. in the city's current redevelopment. "That partnership is important," said one, "because SFI acts as sort of a development concierge." This has made development easier — "there aren't as many hoops to jump through," one said — but there's still room for improvement in the city's drive to become a customer-focused organization. All three praised the attitude within City Hall and, in particular, in the current City Manager.

Leadership was also a theme in one comment — that one of the most important positive signs is that key leaders throughout Saginaw County "are all fully committed to the City."

The city's efforts to reduce crime and eliminate blight have paid tangible benefits; interviewees noted reductions in crime and blight as important achievements — with one "but." "I can't say perception is as far advanced as the progress," one said. "Perception is still the biggest challenge."

The Saginaw River was cited by two interviewees as a key to Saginaw's uniqueness. "People are attracted to water," said one; another called it "our most valuable resource." "Old Town has a great vibe," he said, "and it could be unbelievable if we can continue to develop property along the river. That could be a catalyst. That's what makes the city unique — the possibilities offered by the architecture that's already there and the access to the river, Saginaw Bay and the Great Lakes beyond."

One cited Saginaw's history – and (completely unprompted) its historic architecture – as unique features. "We haven't capitalized on our history," he said. "We don't have a lumberman's monument here. And our historic buildings still attract people."

One saw Saginaw's uniqueness centering on its medical community. "That population of patient and provider base is a unique feature to Saginaw," he said, "and a tremendous strength. Healthcare and healthcare education is one of the biggest single catalysts we've had in the last 50-plus years. It's a huge opportunity that we can't let slip away. It draws in the faculties, makes us a center for research and opens opportunities for new capital, startup industries, spinoff businesses, data centers ... it just leads into so many different subsectors while improving patient care."

Neighborhood Associations

Not surprisingly, the consensus among neighborhood association leadership at the January NAAG meeting was that things in Saginaw were significantly better than they were 10 years ago. They noted reductions in crime and blight, the community police officer model and the strong relationship between City government and the associations. "We have good representation for constructing community involvement. It's not just a good-old-boy network; there's lots of community engagement."

They praised the City's foresight ("We're working hard to improve.") and noted the economic opportunities offered by the healthcare industry. They also noted the importance of Delta College and CMU's investments in the City and the development of new entertainment, dining and nightlife opportunities. "I'm amazed," said one person, "when I hear somebody say, 'There's nothing to do here.'"

Among the qualities this group believes makes Saginaw unique are its people: "We're tough, we persevere." Like other groups, they felt a sense of history was important. "We know we've been here a long time ... and we're not going anywhere."

But even while noting the importance of Saginaw's history, one member of the NAAG group provided some valuable context about the danger of nostalgia: "We're better off," she said, "if we take away 'Remember when' and think about 'Remember now.'"

Survey

We knew going in that our interview groups would tend to demonstrate a pro-Saginaw bias. We were interested in knowing how the broader public feels about the gains that have been made. We were particularly interested in looking at differences in perceptions among different groups – City residents vs. non-residents, Boomers vs. Millennials, etc. Based on anecdotal evidence, we were expecting a sharp age-based difference in perceptions.

We were surprised.

One question dealt purely with perceptions of Saginaw's progress. It was the same question we posed to interviewees: Is Saginaw better or worse than it was five to 10 years ago. Here we offered nine specific attributes to rank on a five-point scale, from "significantly worse" to "the same" to "significantly better."

Just over half of the 263 respondents live within ZIP codes that are predominantly in the City of Saginaw (48601, 48602, 48607), a third are from Saginaw Township and Thomas Township ZIPs and the remaining 16 percent are spread throughout the region.

We expected significant differences between residents of the City of Saginaw and those living outside the City. As we can see in Table 2, this was not the case. In some categories, in fact – crime and blight in particular – more progress was noted by non-residents than by residents, although the differences are statistically insignificant.

Less surprising — if disappointing — was the scores themselves. Entertainment, dining and nightlife was



Table 1: Residence of Respondents

the only category that got close to a ranking of 4 ("Better"). Most hovered between "About the Same" or "Better," with "City Services" dropping slightly below "About the Same."



Table 2: Question 1, sorted by place of residence



Table 3: Question 1, sorted by age

We also expected significant differences in attitudes by age, with younger people seeing more improvement than older people. As we see in Table 3, there are differences, but they are not as significant as we expected – and older adults gave us a bit of a surprise. The youngest (18-29 years) and oldest (50-plus) offered the most positive scores, while people 30-49 were consistently lower.

This may mirror a dynamic that has been observed in attitudes toward urban and suburban living in general, in which urban living is more appealing (or "better") to young adults and empty nesters, but far less so to people in their child-bearing and -rearing years.

It seems the demographic factor which most influences one's attitudes about Saginaw's progress in the last decade is educational level. In Table 4 we see those differences; in seven of nine categories, a higher education correlates with a more positive attitude.



Table 4: Question 1, sorted by educational level

This pattern holds true for several other quality-of-life questions. For example, Question 2 was "How do you rate Saginaw on each of the following properties?" and offered a scale of 1 (Poor) to 5 (Excellent). The ratings only reached "average" or above in eight of 17 categories, and the difference between residents and non-residents was miniscule. Surprisingly, residents scored most categories slightly lower than non-residents.



Table 5: Question 2, sorted by place of residence

The differences here by age (Table 6) were a little greater than in the "how have things changed" question. Again, only eight of 17 qualities are rated "average" or above and, as before, the oldest age group and the youngest generally give the highest scores. The exception here seems to be in rating "Cost of living." Apparently, the older one gets, the more one believes it costs to live in Saginaw. As with the first question, the largest divide is one of education (Table 7). "Cost of living" has a full one-point spread between people with graduate degrees and those with high school diplomas or less.



Table 6: Question 2, sorted by age



Table 7: Question 2, sorted by education level

In questions 3 and 4, we attempted to establish how Saginaw measures up against qualities sought by homeowners — and, one can presume, business decision-makers as well. Using the same 1-5 scale, we asked respondents to rank Saginaw against a list of commonly used quality-of-life criteria. As we see in Table 8, in most categories, there is an inverse relationship; Saginaw is rated low on the qualities judged most important and vice-versa. Saginaw's overall average score is 2.8 — just a hair below "average." Its highest scores are in affordability of housing, traffic congestion and proximity to churches — the latter being the least important quality.





In Table 9, we see differences in these perceptions between City of Saginaw residents and non-residents, where there are nearly half-point swings in crime and traffic congestion and only minor differences elsewhere. Table 10 shows us differences in educational level – once again, a stark contrast in some categories, indicating that people with higher educations have higher opinions of Saginaw.



Table 9: Question 4, sorted by place of residence



Table 10: Question 4, sorted by educational level

What Makes Saginaw Unique?

This open-ended question received 162 responses. As is often the case, the responses say as much about the respondent as they do about Saginaw, especially when they're examined in the context of that respondent's other answers.

The people who gave the most consistently low scores on questions 1, 2 and 4 also had negative comments here: "Nothing," "It's a shothole," "Crime," "The crappy city council" or "Complete lack of control or effort by those in political and influential seats."

There were four themes that were woven through the most commonly mentioned comments:

- Friendliness, neighborliness, diversity and warmth of the people
- The City's history and its historic architecture
- Specific entertainment and cultural attractions, either singular or in groups
- Resiliency in the community and its people and, as one respondent put it, the ability of Saginaw to re-invent itself

The responses are reflected in the word cloud below.



News and Information

One of the major problems the City of Saginaw faces – and it faces it in common with much of the business community – is the erosion of the area's (if not the nation's) local news infrastructure. As recently as 20 years ago, *The Saginaw News* published at least 24 to 30 pages daily, had a newsroom staff of nearly 100 people. It generated hundreds of local stories a week that ran the spectrum of "good" and "bad" news. More important, the relative "importance" of that news was curated.

Today, *The News* operates with a skeleton staff of reporters, generating fewer than 20 local stories per day - and those are now easily lost among Bay City, Flint and Grand Rapids stories, all being edited and curated in Grand Rapids. The news that gets through is mostly "bad."

The loss of the local news infrastructure is why Saginaw's crime rate is often perceived as being at something close to an all-time high - when in fact it is significantly lower than it was during what most consider "the good old days" of the 1970s.

On Friday, April 6, we did a Google News search for "Saginaw, Michigan" and noted the top 48 stories to show in the results.

- Twelve were what could be considered "positive," "informational" or "feelgood."
- Three of those included stories about the Saginaw Spirit.
- One of them could be considered "good," although the need for \$1.3 million in road funding is not.
- Even six years after it happened, we still have Milton Hall showing up in the top 48 stories.
- The first eight are all frightening.



Prosecutor jabs back after DeLand's attorney calls charges 'outright ... WNEM Saginaw - 4 hours ago "The day after the May 2017 incident, the victim's father reported the incident to the Catholic Diocese of **Saginaw** and never heard back from them, nor received word the police were notified by them," a press release from Berg said. After DeLand's arrest in February, the victim's father and the victim reached ...

Saginaw-Area Priest Facing Additional Sexual Assault Charges WKAR - 20 hours ago View all



10-year-old prankster with a hall pass caused panic at **Saginaw** school MLive.com - 20 hours ago

SAGINAW, MI – An issued hall pass is what cracked the case of who made the prank call alerting police there was a shooting at a Saginaw elementary school. Saginaw police and other law enforcement agencies from throughout Saginaw County responded to Kempton Elementary School the morning of ...



Witness testifies **Saginaw** man was killed over dice game MLive.com - Apr 4, 2018 **SAGINAW**, MI – A dice game at a Saginaw house party precipitated one man being

SAGINAW, MI – A dice game at a Saginaw house party precipitated one man being shot dead, according to one witness to the ordeal. The witness testified during the April 3 preliminary examination of Alvin E. Stephenson III, 22, held before Saginaw County District Judge David D. Hoffman. The judge ...

Police serve search warrants in possible **Saginaw** drug operation WNEM Saginaw - Apr 4, 2018 View all



False report of **Saginaw** school shooting draws big police response MLive.com - Apr 5, 2018 SAGINAW ML - Server parent's worst hightmare played out Thursday morphol

 $\begin{array}{l} \textbf{SAGINAW, MI} \stackrel{l}{\rightarrow} Every parent's worst nightmare played out Thursday morning at a Saginaw elementary school when heavily-armed officers stormed the building on reports of an active shooter. The report, however, ended up being false. Police say a child took another's cellphone and called Saginaw ... \\ \end{array}$



WNEM Saginaw - Apr 3, 2018 Managing a family member's affairs can be complicated and if not done properly, very costly. One Mid-Michigan man is sharing his story in hopes others can learn from his experience. "It's already been six months and no one's given me any answers," said Pete Kastros, Saginaw resident. His mother, a...

Saginaw man: Still no death benefit 6 months after mom's death

Police scour Old Town Saginaw for bank robbery suspect Prosecutor jabs back after DeLand's attorney calls charges 'outright ... 10-year-old prankster with a hall pass caused panic at Saginaw school Witness testifies Saginaw man was killed over dice game False report of Saginaw school shooting draws big police response Saginaw man: Still no death benefit 6 months after mom's death Police make 4 arrests, seize heroin, crack, guns in Saginaw raids 5 shot at Saginaw house party on Easter were all teenagers Lines stretch out the door for free pizza at Saginaw Little Caesars Feds intercept cocaine headed from California through Illinois to ... Saginaw school board keeping guiet over fired superintendent 3 arrested after agents use fake cocaine to bust Saginaw drug deal Saginaw Spirit veterans see season, OHL careers come to close Saginaw Spirit cap season with close loss to top-ranked Greyhounds Saginaw City Council member files wrongful termination suit against ... Crews break ground on Delta's downtown Saginaw campus Four men rescued from Saginaw River by fisherman Real Talk 2018 taking place at Saginaw High School Investigation looming over the Catholic Diocese of Saginaw continues Preview: Saginaw Spirit bring playoff hockey home to The Dow for ... Michigan-Based Duperon Corporation CEO Tammy Bernier ... Parishioners celebrating Holy Week with 'heavy hearts' amid ... How Saginaw, Michigan became the center of college basketball's ... Saginaw cardiologist accused of choking girlfriend Yoga meets beer at Saginaw brewery State ending bottled water for Flint residents, says water quality is ... Free carbon monoxide alarms for city of Saginaw residents Polling locations changing for some Saginaw residents Police arrest 13-year-old for having gun outside Saginaw ... Oh Barnacles! Saginaw rolls out new car boot Saginaw Animal Control tax proposal tabled until next commissioner ... Second Saginaw Priest Suspended Big changes headed to downtown Saginaw Fire rips through Saginaw Township apartment complex Saginaw to receive \$1.3 million boost in road funding Saginaw leaders join state senators to combat sexual assault Report: Saginaw is most obese county in Michigan Halfway house victim was starting new life Police ID man killed in domestic dispute on Saginaw's West Side Graphic Video Released In 2012 Police Shooting Of Michigan Man ... Saginaw police car crash caught on video Eight people charged in two 2017 Saginaw homicides Saginaw ISD seeks to change how Saginaw Career Complex is ... Security in Places of Worship training held at Hopevale Church ... Aldi plans to bring new, modern design to Saginaw store Part of Saginaw's State Street closed to replace water line Car crashes into tree near bridge on Saginaw's southwest end Investigators begin talking with Saginaw Diocese in sexual assault ...

The typical MLive/Saginaw feed online will contain, at any given time, maybe two or three visible stories specific to Saginaw. Here, in this sample, we really see none, among stories on Flint, Michigan State football, Great Lakes Kiteboarding, a teen drug raid, a missing teen and University of Michigan football. (And remember: this was in April.)



And you'll not do much better looking at WNEM TV-5's online feed: an antidepressant ban, a Gladwin story, a Flint story, Saginaw robbery story, Bay County fugitive, southwest Michigan, Flint water, MSU scandal, Father DeLand ...

There's not a lot of Saginaw news, and even less Saginaw business news or Saginaw good news. And that's why people are so gloom and doom; this is all they see. When we get to our tactical plan, we'll talk about ways to overcome this.



Target Audiences

In our initial meeting with Saginaw's planning team, you identified your target audiences

as:

- Visitors to attractions in the City of Saginaw
- Residents: Initially, residents of the City of Saginaw and, eventually, people throughout the county and region
- Major employers in manufacturing, healthcare, service and retail
- Entrepreneurs

In each of these audiences, we need to consider a dynamic in which we would begin with the "inner circle" – the people who already believe in Saginaw's renaissance – and move outward to eventually reach the entire state.

From those four initial groups, we have identified eight different audiences in three broad

categories. The first two categories are divided less by who the audiences are than by the way we will reach them.

General Audiences

The first group is a very general audience, and we're looking at them as part of Everett Rogers' adoption curve (one of our favorite takes on that curve is in the Brand Camp cartoon at right). These people will be in what we'll call the "blast radius" of any general communications you do as well as word of mouth. And, like a blast, it will move outward, starting with:



Inner Circle

These are the Garbers, Shaheens, Spences, City of Saginaw leadership, the people in PRIDE, the DSA and everyone else who's already on board and making things work. They're the believers, the participants, the people who are driving change. These are what we would call innovators and early adopters on Rogers' curve.

They don't need to be convinced of anything. They are already believers and evangelists. They will tell your story, but they need help in telling it. They need to be equipped.

Early Majority

These are people who really want to see something happen. Like Agent Fox Mulder, they *want* to believe, but aren't quite convinced that it's happening yet. Despite Bancroft/Eddy, despite the SVRC Marketplace, despite the CMU Medical School, they still aren't sure. And that's largely because they haven't seen any of it first-hand.

They need to be led to where they can see it. They're the ones who will respond to the Inner Circle's evangelizing. Once they do see it first-hand, they create the tipping point and become evangelists, too.

Followers

Then there are the followers. They would be people in the "Late Majority" and "Laggards" groups in Rogers' curve. They're unconvinced right now that anything good is happening in Saginaw or that it ever will. But once everyone else is doing it, they'll do it, too.

'Blast Radius'		
Inner Circle	Believers, participants, drivers of change	
	Don't need convincing; they need a message to evangelize	
Early Majority	Unconvinced, but want to believe	
Early Majority	Need to be led to where they can see for themselves	
Fellowers	Unconvinced, not sure what to believe	
Followers	Will go with the eventual flow	

Those audience groups and key characteristics in table form:

Specialized Audiences

The second group have very specific needs and desires and will generally require more specialized media to reach them. These are audiences who must be reached through what we might call surgical strikes: tightly targeted communications with very specific messages. They include:

Entrepreneurs

During our meetings, we talked some about how Saginaw, having always been a "company town," has not always been, in the past, an extremely entrepreneurial town. That's changing now, since we have at least a generation and a half that has not grown up in a company town. So, in addition to drawing entrepreneurs from elsewhere, we need to cultivate the home-grown ones. And the way we get people to be more entrepreneurial is to change the conversation – at every level – from "jobs" to "opportunities."

Large Employers

Large employers, no matter what the industry, are looking for critical mass — of customers, if they're retail/service, patients if they're healthcare, suppliers and skilled workers in manufacturing, plus the usual bells and whistles. Our message here is that the heart of the Great Lakes Bay Region is a great place to locate.

Developers

Developers are also looking for critical mass, which is why we've seen so much development along Washington since the Shaheens planted the first flags there. They want ROI, so we want to let them know they can still get in on the ground floor.

Realtors®

And we want to talk to Realtors — and everyone in the real estate community, both residential and commercial. For decades, real estate people have been trained and conditioned to look outward, toward the boundless suburbs. We need to let them know there's opportunity for them to make money here, as well. No, a commission on a house in Heritage Square isn't going to be the same as a house in Autumn Ridge. But you have a generation of first-time home buyers looking for cool urban spaces, and if you don't handle their deal, somebody else will.

'Surgical Strike'	
Entrepreneurs	Near and far, home-grown
	Change conversation from "jobs" to "opportunities"
Large Employers	Looking for critical mass
Large Employers	Saginaw: it's a great place to be
Developers	Looking for critical mass
Developers	Get in on the ground floor
Realtors	Used to looking away from the city
Reallors	"There's gold in them there streets"

Influencers

The groups above would generally have a direct exchange relationship with the City of Saginaw and its businesses — we're encouraging them to be part of the hands-on process of starting, expanding or patronizing Saginaw businesses. In addition to these groups, we also have a group with a more indirect relationship.

Influencers would include:

- Community leadership: Business, social and civic leaders. We recognize there is considerable overlap between this group and other direct groups above.
- News media: This would include news media serving the Great Lakes Bay Region as well as statewide media.
- Social media power users. As the size and influence of local news media has declined, social media has filled the vacuum. Social media "power users" – people with large followings on Twitter, Facebook and Instagram – have become important thought leaders in the community.

Most are extremely invested in the success of the community and are excited by good stories. Our goal is to turn them into evangelists for the City of Saginaw by ensuring they have access to good, "shareable" stories.

Goals and Objectives

There are three things communications can change:

- Awareness, or what people know
- Attitudes, or what people believe
- Behavior, or what people do

We believe this sequence is important, because behavior is driven by what we believe, and our beliefs are created by what we know. Therefore, in this case, we cannot make people visit, patronize businesses in or invest in the City of Saginaw until a) they know what it has to offer and b) they believe it is of value.

In this plan, we have dealt almost exclusively with goals. Many of these goals *could* be numerically objectified and measured. But the cost of measuring them would easily exhaust the resources you've allocated for marketing communications. We believe it would be far more prudent for you to spend your dollars spreading the word than measuring how far it's spread.

The goals for this communication effort are:

Awareness

We want people to know:

- What's going on? A tremendous amount of development has already occurred in Saginaw, and it has created many new job and business opportunities.
- That good things are happening, and some of them may not be obvious or well-known: job creation, declining crime rate, blight elimination.
- What's on the horizon? There are other projects that have just launched or are in the talk stages: Delta College, the Bearinger Building, the old Case Funeral Home
- The economics of all this activity. There's a lot of money being invested in Saginaw that's creating a lot of opportunity.
- There are new opportunities for housing.

It's typical for the "Awareness" goals of a marcom plan to include things such as unaided recall and name recognition. While these might be helpful down the road for specialized audiences – out-of-state site selectors, for example – we don't believe they are applicable at this time.

Attitude

We want people to believe:

- Saginaw is reinventing itself. Again. It's no longer a one-horse General Motors town and is growing a highly diversified economy. It's far more likely for people to believe this if we help them remember that Saginaw has always reinvented itself, many times, throughout its history.
- That reinvention is good news.
- There is *opportunity* here. And that translates in different ways to each of your different audiences: opportunity is one thing to a job-seeker, something else to an entrepreneur, and yet something else to the developer or the employer.
- Saginaw has a positive quality of life. This is where the heaviest lifting must be done.
 We need more people to believe that Saginaw is safe, economical, all of those things we saw in survey question 3 the things they believe are important in a place where they work or live.

Behavior

We want people to:

- Invest. Financially and emotionally. In a business. In a home. This is a very broad idea, and it will be expressed in many different ways depending on the audience.
- Evangelize. We no longer have a daily newspaper. Our other news sources are limited in content and reach. Most people depend on word of mouth from friends, which they're now most likely to get through Facebook, Twitter or Instagram. We need people to preach, and we'll need to give them tools to use to do it, which means encouraging and producing shareable content.

RRC Evaluation Criteria

In addition to what AMPM generally includes in a marketing communications plan, there are specific criteria the Redevelopment Ready Communities program uses in evaluating a community's plan. These include:

- Identify opportunities. To some degree, that's already been done by the City's team before we started this process, and we have identified more in our target audiences. But we do have, on the following page, some specific opportunities that are expected to rise from the execution of this plan.
- Outline specific steps to attract businesses, consumers and real estate development to the community. These are covered in the tactical plan to follow.
- Strive to create or strengthen an image for the community. The creative strategy that
 has emerged from this planning process and how it is executed in specific tactics is
 designed to shape a new and powerful image for Saginaw.
- Identify approaches to market priority sites. The infrastructure for this is already largely in place through the GreatLakesBaySites portal; tactics executed with this plan will help increase its visibility and use.
- Coordinate marketing efforts with local, regional and state partners. This is also something Saginaw is already doing; many of the activities in this plan will create new partnership opportunities.

Opportunities

Because of a critical mass of new development – and the large amount of real estate available – Saginaw's greatest opportunities lie along and nearby the Riverfront Saginaw corridor. The City's marketing team has identified these as the main opportunities:

- Market-rate or even upscale multifamily residential.
- Boutique retail and food and beverage. We say boutique here, because there's opportunity for a Bradley's or a Stable, but the city isn't quite in the position to create an opportunity for a PF Chang's or REI. Yet.
- Medical-related businesses. This could include actual care delivery or some form of spinoff or related to medical research.

While not restricted to the Riverfront area, there are still opportunities in:

- Precision manufacturing, which has been one of the Saginaw area's greatest growth engines over the last decade.
- Agribusiness, since Saginaw County still has a significant amount of agricultural land and much of the agribusiness infrastructure is in place. Given the importance of exports to ag, however, we must put a big question mark on this one at the present time.

Message Strategy

This is a good place for a reality check, where we need to remind all involved of a few key things:

- 1. The major driving force behind bad attitudes about Saginaw, what keeps the late majority and the laggards on the right-hand side of the adoption curve, is confirmation bias: our built-in tendency to reject information that does not agree with our beliefs.
- 2. A slogan, a tagline or a jingle, by itself, won't change minds about Saginaw.
- 3. Neither will statistics. We can give people hard numbers until we're blue in the face, and it won't change their minds. Confirmation bias is unimpressed by numbers.
- 4. We let down our confirmation bias guard only for stories, because we're programmed to relate emotionally to them. Our ancestors didn't sit around the fire in the cave and explain the existence of the universe through statistics. But they got people to believe some whopper stories.
- 5. What ultimately changes our minds is discovery. We're much more likely to adopt information that we *find* than what we're *told*. Or, as George Bernard Shaw wrote, "What we want to see is the child in pursuit of knowledge, not knowledge in pursuit of the child."

This is similar to the goal for Riverfront Saginaw, but your primary audiences have a much tighter focus - business development - and you have a much larger geographic footprint. That leaves you with more baggage: the city as a whole has more crime and more blight than Riverfront does. We all know that crime and blight are significantly lower than they were 10 years ago.

We know that our economy is much more diverse than it was in "the good old days" before the Middle East oil embargo years.

We know that a tremendous amount of new development is occurring.

We know that Saginaw is now where Detroit was just a few years ago and where DC, Baltimore and Cleveland were 15 or 20 years ago: poised for new economic growth and urban reinvestment. The challenge is getting more people to believe.

That early majority, they're skeptical. They're not going to respond to statistics. They're not going to believe an idea that doesn't somehow square with reality as they see it. The biggest strategic challenge is to tell the story of Saginaw today and the Saginaw of the future ... within a framework that is consistent with what people consider to be the reality of Saginaw.

That means you can't hide from the bad news: you need to acknowledge the warts. We need to balance believability and credibility with optimism and excitment.

We know history repeats itself. When you study history, you see that politics, economics, social movements, even crime – pretty much everything is cyclical.

People accept that. They get it. But sometimes, they just need help seeing the cycles. We're going help them.

We're going to show Saginaw's place in a well-known national cycle of urban, economic and social change. We will tie that cyclical nature to the thing that appeals most to those early adopters: Opportunity.

We'll do this while following the most important rule of storytelling: Show, don't tell.

Strategic Goals

According to the best practices the MEDC has established for an RRC marketing plan, your tactics must support three specific strategic goals:

- Attract business
- Attract consumers, and by this they're referring both to customers of the businesses you attract as well as potential homeowners, who are "consumers" of municipal services
- Attract real estate development a necessity to do the first two

Ordinarily when AMPM creates a marketing communications plan, it assumes that one party - usually the agency - will be executing the tactics ... or will work on them with the client's marketing staff.

This case is a little different. There are many different moving parts – the City, the DDA, Saginaw Future, the Riverfront marketing group, business associations and individual businesses within the City. So this plan is more about tying together all those different efforts and making sure they're going in the same direction. So this was – and continues to be – a much more collaborative process. Here are the tactical activities we recommend under each of these three main goals.

Attract Business

1. Overcome Crime Perception Issues

This will be listed in more than one area. If we think back to our research on those top 48 Google search results and about what people see in the news media about Saginaw, we need to find a way to overcome that.

We no longer have a daily newspaper that will give us a whole section of business news and 10 pages of "good" news along with the five pages of crime. Local radio news is all but dead. And TV news, as we know, is where it has to "bleed to lead."

The city must generate content. And it has to be shareable content, which means it's the kind of thing that people — not just you, but people who have hundreds or thousands of social media followers — will share. Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, YouTube and LinkedIn have taken the place that, 30 years ago, *The Saginaw News, Detroit Free Press* and *Detroit News* filled: the place where smart people get their news and information.

This will be a challenge, and we have several suggestions on how to accomplish it.

2. Foster Entrepreneurship

As noted earlier, it's important to look differently at entrepreneurship. We don't just want to attract out-of-town businesses to locate or expand here. We need to encourage the Steve and Lisa Kellys and Ryan Seifferleins to go for it, cultivating our home-grown entrepreneurs.

That will include potential spin-offs. Midland is a good example of entrepreneurs spinning off. In fact, Dow Corning was a spin-off. Here we have Nexteer, which is full of engineer inventors who all have an idea. We have med schools and teaching hospitals where they'll be doing clinical trials.

And you've got generational differences: Millennials, bless their hearts, don't cling to the classic Midwestern industrial model of "find a good job with a big company and keep it." Mainly because that doesn't happen any more.

The role of communications here: You need to be an advocate, encouraging people to follow their dreams. "We're ready to help you build your opportunity." And then you need to help them connect with resources: SEDC, CMU-RC, capital, incentives ... advertising agencies.

3. Encourage Matchmaking

Matchmaking in this concept means working closely with businesses who are making connections with other businesses that may benefit from a presence of some kind, here. This is particularly applicable to companies with a large economic or geographic footprint. Healthcare is an obvious field, but look at Morley, which works with a host of *Fortune* 500 companies, Merrill Technologies Group, Nexteer: look at both sides of their transactions. Does Nexteer have a supplier that should be here? Does Merrill have a customer that would benefit from a local presence?

SFI does a lot of this already. Our goal here is one of communication: what tools are needed to facilitate that process?

4. Support SFI

You already have an "agent" responsible for attracting business. By "support" here, we mean providing the additional tools they may need. Right now, SFI is short on collateral materials specific to the city of Saginaw.

SFI should have a Saginaw-specific, general business-oriented brochure, even if it isn't printed. SFI has county-wide pieces, but you need to drill down more specifically.

You need a directory of resources for businesspeople and entrepreneurs — not only of resources available through the City of Saginaw but through partners and other sources. Again, SFI has something like that, but it's a little hard to find.

The website is something we'll touch on in several different areas, as well. If I'm from Muncie, Indiana, and I want to build a new plant in Saginaw, I don't know about Saginaw's relationship with SFI. The City's "community and economic development" website section must offer that help. We have been working with City staff on creating a stronger web presence.

Attract Consumers

1. Overcome Crime and Blight Perception Issues

"Consumers" in this case, include consumers in every sense: People who shop in your stores, dine in your restaurants, buy homes in your neighborhoods and rent your apartments. One of our first priorities here, again, is overcoming the perception of crime and blight issues. We'll be looking at ways for the City to generate positive content, and that will include a little more news on the fight against blight.

2. Product Improvements

There's an old saying that the best advertisement is a great product. And while there are a lot of great things about our product, there are areas that need work. The most obvious area would be streets, but we also have trouble with the condition of some of our parks and right of ways, particularly in the summer months.

We don't want to sound like we're picking on Phil Karwat; we fully understand this is more of a systemic financial issue throughout the state. But it's important to remember that even if everything else about a shopping, dining or entertainment experience is perfect, people tend to remember the worst thing that happens. We don't want it to be losing a tire to a pothole.

3. Mobilize Real Estate Community

It's important to mobilize the real estate community more directly – particularly residential real estate. It's our impression that most of the area's Realtors aren't sure how to sell a house in the City of Saginaw, so they don't even try.

There are two huge trends that emerged over the last 30 years that our realty community never capitalized on because they've never really been in touch with specialty audiences:

- Small houses, which most of ours are
- Old houses, which most of ours also are

The Bohemian bourgeoisie who buys an old mansion in Heritage Square, or the doubleincome gay couple who buys one in the Cathedral District, do it because they have to work hard to make it happen. It's largely because once you get past two or three specific Realtors in town, they can't fathom why on earth anyone would want anything other than a brand-new, huge McMansion in a township.

A perfect example, although it's a commercial property, is the Malcolm House on North Michigan. Queen Anne mansion, designed by a nationally renowned architect, listed on the National Register of Historic Places. It's been listed with a half-dozen agents over the last eight years. They put it in the multiple listing book, they put a sign out front, and that's about it. It's just another commercial parcel to them. It has finally sold, but to someone who plans to raze it.

This will involve a training/orientation program of some form.

4. Co-Promote with Saginaw Businesses

There are many ways for the City to co-promote with its local businesses. If you had a boatload of cash, we'd say that you would make a build-an-ad kit and offer co-op dollars for businesses who took part in the "We Build" campaign with you. But you don't.

This falls under the heading of killing two birds with one stone, because one of the things we can do here is count on those businesses to generate some of that content we need out there. So if Jake's creates a "This is Saginaw: Build your brunch" video ad, it's important that it gets to the 8,000 followers the "We Build" page has.

There's also the flip side: it's an outlet for your content. This can get more into the technological weeds, but there's no reason the "We Build" video shouldn't be available on the Dow Event Center's website. It would be even better to eventually get that video and your future video content on big screens in every bar and restaurant in town.

You also have the opportunity for packaging. Tickets to the Spirit game, a coupon for a pregame dinner at the Savoy and after-dinner drinks at Bourbon. Nobody is working on facilitating this sort of thing once you get outside of the Riverfront group, and even there it's still underused.

Attract Development

1. Mobilize Real Estate Community

Again, it's important to mobilize the real estate community, this time on the commercial side. While they are more astute here, many still can't completely wrap their minds around something like the Bearinger Building.

This reorientation goes beyond historic properties. It's more about making sure we play to our strengths. Old buildings are one of them. Brownfields are another. It's important that we identify the unique attributes of our commercial real estate and make sure our Realtors are able to turn those attributes into sales points.

2. Seek Compatible Developers

We also need to reach out, aggressively, to developers whose niches or areas of expertise are compatible with our inventory. This means developers who specialize in historic properties or brownfield sites, for example. And it means niche developers and those who are kind of on the second tier. The first-tier developers – the Dan Gilberts and Ilitches – have enough money to buy multimillion dollar sites in major markets. We're more successful with those at the next level: Lakeshore or Alex DeParry. We need to make sure we're connecting with them through the right brokers.

It's also important to have the necessary communications tools to support those brokers.

3. Support SFI

As with attracting businesses, it's important to make sure SFI has whatever support materials they need, especially as it relates to the "build opportunity" message.

4. Support Land Bank

The same materials can also be helpful in your partnership with the Saginaw County Land Bank — which is also acting, in a sense, as a broker for some of your commercial inventory. We also believe that the training/orientation session similar to what we've proposed with Realtors might be valuable for some members of the Land Bank board — particularly those from outside the City of Saginaw.

Tactical Plan

You have a big job and a relatively thin budget. We have broken things out so that they may be phased in over a two- to three-year time frame. We're looking at Year 1 as beginning with the current fiscal year, 2018-2019.

Year 1

Website

A website is one of the requirements for RRC certification, and City staff have been at work working on one that meets RRC criteria. We want to make sure it plays well with the rest of the campaign.

Timeline	Q3 2018	
Responsibilities	AMPM	Writing/rewriting key sections of site and consultation on imagery and functionality
	City	Construction and maintenance
Pudget		\$2,000 for consultative services
Budget	Other Resources	Staff time

Collateral

Saginaw Future has a main collateral piece called "Great opportunities." It is a county-wide piece; we strongly recommend a version geared specifically to the City of Saginaw. How that happens is between the City and its contracted economic development department, but we have built in a budget to make that happen.

Timeline	Q3 2018	
AMPM Consultation, oth		Consultation, other services as needed
Responsibilities	SFI & City Update and production	
Budget		\$2,000 as required for helping SFI, printing or other expense

Content Development & Distribution

We have outlined the difficulty we have with no daily local newspaper and other limited local news outlets. It is critical to get positive stories written about Saginaw and in front of people. Surveys indicate that most people use social media for some of their news, and many use it as their primary source.

Three platforms are key for the City: Facebook for older adults. Instagram is where you'll reach younger people. And we see a role for Twitter in between, particularly for influencers.

The challenge is to create and manage the content. We recommend one of five options:

- A full-time information officer.
- Interns over the course of the year. They would need some professional guidance on the types of content you need to drive.
- User-generated content. You encourage people in the community to create content and share it, and you curate it. This also calls for you to take advantage of "influencers" — people who, like LaMarr Woodley, have an interest in the City and a rather large social media following. The influencers would need some guidance on what they do or do not share, or, ideally, create themselves, but this offers far less control.
- Hire a firm such as AMPM to create, curate and manage your content.

Timeline	System in place by Q4 2018 and ongoing	
Responsibilities	AMPM Varies, depending on model used	
Budget	\$2,000 to \$5,000 for first three options (annually) \$20,000 for fourth option*	

*Special allocation above the \$20,000 annual marketing budget

Brand Video

Your first content should be your brand video, which sets the stage for the three-year campaign. A script is already written, and AMPM (and Greg) will contribute in-kind time to provide creative direction and production oversight. We would expect to use the City's inhouse video capabilities as much as possible. We have built in a budget for any necessary footage that we may need to capture, for music and other miscellaneous expenses.

Timeline	Completed in Q3 2018		
Posponsibilitios	AMPM Script, direction, coordination		
Responsibilities	City	Videography, editing	
Budget		\$5,000 set-aside for any necessary expenses	

Advertising, Co-Op, Partner Support

There are several parts to this, the first being one of the things the marketing group discussed from the very beginning: materials that marketing partners can use to help promote the City of Saginaw in their advertising, which is co-operative advertising in its classic sense.

Once these materials are created, though, there are many non-traditional opportunities for "free" or low-cost advertising as well. They're just not what we would traditionally think of as advertising media. We recommend exploring putting the "We Build …" message on everything from the electronic billboard above the Wickes Tower to snowplow blades, on traffic barricades, on sponsorship signs at events such as Friday Night Live and Spirit games … wherever the message fits and you don't have to pay hard dollars for the space. We want to turn the creative team loose on how to extend the "We Build" message to community events and activities.

Timeline	Launch in Q3 2018		
Bosponsibilitios	АМРМ	Creation, copywriting, design, design guidelines, production of "kit," consultation as "brand council," assistance in partner recruiting	
Responsibilities	City, SFI	Arrangements with partners for large-format printing and other "media" costs in return for credit line or other consideration	
Budget		\$6,000	

Year 1 Budget Recap

	Low	High
Website:	\$2,000	
Collateral:	\$2,000	
Branded Content:	\$2,000	\$5,000
Video:	\$5,000	
Advertising/Co-Op	\$6,000	
Total*	\$17,000	\$20,000

*Does not include separate additional allocation for content management

Content Development & Distribution

In Year 2, your groundwork will be laid. You will still need to generate and distribute content, and start expanding the reach a little. One way we'll do that is with more promoted or sponsored posts. Facebook, Twitter and Instagram all allow you to buy impressions, and in year two we'll start doing that.

AMPM's role will still depend on the model you use for this process, but we will bump the budget up to cover the additional cost of sponsored/promoted posts.

Timeline	Ongoing through FY 2019-20 and 2020-21		
Responsibilities	AMPM	AMPM Varies, depending on model used	
Budget	\$7,500 if using internal/user-generated models \$27,500 if AMPM manages content*		
		*\$20,000 of this is above the annual marketing budget	

Advertising, Co-Op, Partner Support

In Years 2 and 3, we'll want to keep refreshing the materials you're creating, both for your use and partner use: new executions, new placements, new messages. Only now, we recommend that you start placing some ads in traditional media, primarily online. These would be online networks that appeal to the segments noted.

Timeline	Ongoing through FY 2019-20 and 2020-21		
Despensibilities	AMPM	Refresh materials, copywriting, design, design guidelines, production of materials, consultation as "brand council," placement	
Responsibilities	City, SFI	Arrangements with partners for large-format printing and other "media" costs in return for credit line or other consideration	
Budget		\$5,000	

Year 2-3 Budget Recap

	2019-2020	2020-2021
Branded Content:	\$7,500	\$7,500
Video:	\$5,000	\$5,000
Advertising/Co-Op	\$5,000	\$5,000
Contingency	\$2,500	\$2,500
Total*	\$20,000	\$20,000

*Does not include separate additional allocation for content management

Appendix Survey Methodology

We used SurveyMonkey.com, an online survey site. The survey consisted of 10 questions, five of which were demographic differentiators. Links were emailed to a number of high-influence social media users in the Saginaw area, who were asked to post it through their social media accounts. This is so potential respondents would associate it with organizations or entities other than the City of Saginaw, AMPM or the former mayor.

The "distributors" were diverse in age and income, but had strong connections to Saginaw County. This diversity is reflected in the respondents, as well. The survey was activated on Feb. 5, 2018, with the last response being completed six days later.

Questions

- 1. For each of the attributes below, please describe how you feel things in the City of Saginaw are compared to five to 10 years ago. Scoring was 1 (significantly worse) to 5 (significantly better) on these attributes:
 - Economic conditions
 - Crime
 - Blight
 - City services
 - Job market

- Business opportunity
- Effective government
- Educational opportunities
- Entertainment, dining and nightlife
- 2. How would you rate the City of Saginaw on the following qualities? Scoring was 1 (poor) to 5 (excellent) on these qualities:
 - Overall feeling of safety
 - Safety in homes and neighborhoods
 - Safety in major commercial/entertainment areas
 - Overall economic health
 - Cost of living
 - Shopping opportunities
 - Dining opportunities
 - Entertainment and nightlife

- Housing options
- Overall ease of travel
- Walkability
- Neighborliness
- Social events and activities
- Openness and acceptance
- Public parking
- Traffic flow
- Vibrant commerical areas
- 3. When you think of choosing a place to live, how important are these factors in your decisionmaking? Scoring was 1 (not at all important) to 5 (critical) on these qualities:
 - Close to work

Close to schools

- Close to church
- Diversity of neighborhood
- Types/styles of available housing
- Investment value of property
- Quality of schools
- Nearby shopping and dining
- Crime/safety

- Traffic congestion
- Affordability of housing
- Taxes
- Parks and recreational opportunities
- Arts and cultural activities
- Architectural and social ambience
- 4. How would you rate the City of Saginaw on the factors people consider in selecting a place to live? Scoring was 1 (poor) to 5 (excellent) on these qualities:
 - Close to work
 - Close to schools
 - Close to church
 - Diversity of neighborhood
 - Types/styles of available housing
 - Investment value of property
 - Quality of schools
 - Nearby shopping and dining

- Crime/safety
- Traffic congestion
- Affordability of housing
- Taxes
- Parks and recreational opportunities
- Arts and cultural activities
- Architectural and social ambience
- 5. What, if anything, do you believe makes the City of Saginaw unique? (Open-ended question)
- 6. In what ZIP Code is your home located?
- What is your age? Choices were: 17 or younger, 18 to 20, 21 to 29, 30 to 39, 40 to 49, 50 to 59, 60 or older.
- 8. What is your gender? Choices were: male, female, non-binary/third gender, prefer not to say.
- 9. What is the highest level of education you have completed? Choices were: did not attend school, 8th grade or less, attended high school but did not graduate, graduated from high school, some college but no degree, associate's degree, bachelor's degree, graduate degree.
- 10. Which best describes your current occupation? These general categories were offered; "Other, please specify" drew the most responses.
 - Management
 - Business and Financial Operations
 - Computer/IT
 - Architecture and Engineering
 - Community and Social Services
 - Legal
 - Education, Training, and Library
 - Arts, Design, Entertainment, Sports, and Media
 - Healthcare Practitioners and Technical

- Healthcare Support
- Protective Service/Public Safety
- Food Preparation and Serving
- Building and Grounds Cleaning and Maintenance
- Personal Care and Service
- Sales
- Office and Administrative Support
- Farming, Fishing, and Forestry
- Construction

- Installation, Maintenance, and Repair
- Production Occupations

- Transportation and Materials Moving
- Other (please specify)

Respondents

The survey drew 268 responses — as noted earlier, just over half were from residents of the City of Saginaw, 26 percent from Saginaw Township, seven percent from Thomas Township and 16 percent from other ZIP Codes.



17AMP576